## Department of Economic and Social Affairs Division for Sustainable Development

## **REPORT**

**Expert Group Meeting on Indicators of Sustainable Development** 

New York, USA

3 - 4 October 2006

## **CONTENTS**

1. Introduction	
A. Background	1
B. Objectives and expected outcomes	2
C. Participants	2
II. Outcome of discussion	2
A . Revised CSD-ISD indicators	2
Poverty	3
Governance	4
Health	4
Education	5
Demographics	5
Natural hazards	
Atmosphere	6
Land	7
Oceans, seas and coasts	7
Freshwater	8
Biodiversity	8
Economic development	
Global economic partnership	
Consumption and production patterns	
B. Conclusions and next steps	
Annex: List of Participants	

#### I. Introduction

### A. Background

- 1. The indicators of sustainable development prepared for the Commission of Sustainable Development (CSD) are currently under revision. The main role of the CSD indicators (CSD-ISD) is to serve as reference for countries to develop national indicators for sustainable development.
- 2. The current CSD-ISD edition was developed between 1994 and 2001 within the CSD Programme of Work on Indicators on Sustainable Development after extensive consultations and national testing programmes. The current CSD-ISD edition consists of 58 indicators embedded in a thematic framework consisting of 15 themes and 38 subthemes. The work programme was mandated by the CSD and had been developed in response to Chapter 40 of Agenda 21, which calls on countries and the international community to develop indicators of sustainable development.
- 3. In 2005, the Division for Sustainable Development (DSD) within the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA) began a review of the CSD indicators as part of its mandated support to United Nations member States in their efforts to develop and implement national indicators for sustainable development. The aim of the review was to incorporate new thinking on sustainable development and the role of indicators, to reflect country experiences with their indicator sets over the past years and to exploit synergies with major indicator initiatives such as the Millennium Development Goals and sectoral indicator programmes.
- 4. The review included three assessments of the following topics: proposals to modify the CSD-ISD submitted by international agencies, coherence between the CSD-ISD and the Millennium Development Goal (MDG) indicators, and international and national trends in developing and implementing indicators of sustainable development. It also included an international expert group meeting (EGM) held in December 2005 in New York.
- 5. The EGM in December 2005 agreed on an interim list of a revised CSD-ISD consisting of 99 indicators. The meeting also agreed to remove explicit division of indicators into four 'pillars' (social, environmental, economic, institutional). It further agreed to distinguish indicators into core and non-core indicators. Core indicators were supposed to be relevant for most countries, whereas non-core indicators would either provide additional information to core indicators or cover issues that are relevant for many but not most countries. The thematic framework should be retained, but themes and subthemes would have to be modified. Finally, the meeting also discussed other indicator frameworks under development and possible options for future work on indicators.
- 6. To finalize the review process, DSD convened a second global Expert Group Meeting. The Meeting was held in New York from 3 4 October 2006. Ms. Kathleen Abdalla, Chief, National Information, Monitoring and Outreach Branch DESA/DSD, chaired the Meeting.

#### B. Objectives and expected outcomes

- 7. The main objective of the meeting was to finalize the revision of the current CSD-ISD. Indicators of Sustainable Development of the Commission of Sustainable Development.
- 8. The expected outcomes of the meeting were agreements on the list of indicators, their names and basic definitions, on the categorization of indicators into core, non-core or other categories, on the list of themes and sub-themes, on the assignment of indicators to themes and sub-themes and on the timeline to develop and revise the methodology sheets for the CSD indicators.

#### C. Participants

9. A list of participants is attached as Annex 1 to the report.

#### II. Outcome of discussion

#### A. Revised CSD-ISD indicators

10. The meeting agreed that the revised CSD-ISD will be placed in fourteen themes:

Poverty	Natural hazards	Economic development
Governance	Atmosphere	Global economic partnership
Health	Land	Consumption and production patterns
Education	Oceans, Seas and Coasts	
Demographics	Freshwater	
	Biodiversity	

- 11. The revised CSD-ISD consists of 98 indicators, of which 50 are core indicators. Core indicators cover issues that are relevant for most countries and that are not adequately covered by other core indicators. In addition, core indicators can be calculated by most countries with readily available data or with data that can be available within reasonable time and costs.
- 12. For all indicators in the CSD-ISD, revised methodology sheets have either been prepared or are under preparation. The indicators outside the core set include a number of indicators for which agreed methodologies are still under development, but that could nevertheless be applied by countries using the basic definition and other information contained in the methodology sheets. Other important issues, such as governance, for which agreed basic definitions are missing are not included in the CSD-ISD, but will be addressed in the upcoming publication on the revised CSD-ISD.

13. The following tables present the revised CSD-ISD on a theme-by-theme basis. Each of the fifteen tables contains sub-themes, names of indicators, and information on whether the indicator is a core indicator. Indicators for which confirmation by the responsible agency on the exact name or other details of the indicator are missing, are marked in italics. As indicators may relate to more than one theme (for example, the indicator on access to sanitation could be assigned to the poverty and the health theme), the forthcoming publication on CSD indicators will contain tables that illustrate the multithematic coverage of the indicators. The following tables also list the lead agencies for each indicator and, for easy reference, include information on their status in the list of MDG indicators. It is indicated whether the CSD-ISD are official MDG indicators ('Main'), included in the additional list of MDG indicators on the official MDG indicators website ('Additional'), include a MDG indicator as a subset ('Subset'), or are part of a MDG indicator ('Superset'). It should be noted that the MDG indicators are currently under review.

#### **Poverty**

Sub-theme	Indicator	Core	Lead agency	MDG
		indicator		indicator
Income poverty	Percent of Population Living	Yes	World Bank	Additional
	Below National Poverty Line			
	Proportion of population		World Bank	Subset
	below International Poverty			
	Line (\$1 and/or \$2)			
Income	Ratio of share in national	Yes	World Bank	
inequality	income of highest to lowest			
_ ,	quintile			
Sanitation	Proportion of population with	Yes	WHO	Main
	access to improved sanitation,			
	urban and rural			
Drinking Water	Proportion of population with	Yes	WHO	Main
	sustainable access to an			
	improved water source, urban			
	and rural			
Access to energy	Share of households with	Yes	IEA (tbc),	
	access to electricity or		IAEA	
	commercial energy			
	Percentage of population		WHO	Main
	using solid fuels for cooking			
<b>Living Conditions</b>	Proportion of urban	Yes	UN-	Main
	population living in		HABITAT	(different
	deprived housing conditions			name)

### Governance

Sub-theme	Indicator	Core	Lead	MDG
		indicator	agency	indicator
Good governance	Percentage of population	Yes	UNODC	
	having paid bribes or other			
	corruption indicator			
Crime	Number of recorded violent	Yes	UNODC	
	crimes and homicides per			
	100,000 population			

## Health

Sub-theme	Indicator	Core indicator	Lead agency	MDG indicator
Mortality	Mortality rate under 5 years old	Yes	UNPD	Main
	Life expectancy at birth	Yes	UNPD	
	Healthy life years expectancy		WHO	
Health Care Delivery	Percent of population with access to primary health care facilities	Yes	WHO	
	Immunization against infectious childhood diseases	Yes	WHO	Subset
	Contraceptive prevalence rate		WHO	Main
Nutritional Status	Nutritional status of children	Yes	WHO	Subset
	Prevalence of tobacco use		WHO	
Health status and risks	Suicide rate		WHO	
	Morbidity of major diseases such as HIV/AIDS, malaria, tubercolosis	Yes	WHO	Subset
	Morbidity of major childhood diseases such as diarrhea, pneumonia, malaria		WHO	

## Education

Sub-theme	Indicator	Core	Lead	MDG
		indicator	agency	indicator
	Gross intake into last year	Yes	UNESCO	Main
	of primary education, by			(different
	sex			name)
	Net enrolment rate in	Yes	UNESCO	Main
	primary education			
<b>Education level</b>	Adult secondary (tertiary)	Yes	UNESCO	
	schooling attainment level,			
	by sex			
	Life long learning		Eurostat	
Literacy	Adult literacy rate, by sex	Yes	UNESCO	Subset

## Demographics

Sub-theme	Indicator	Core indicator	Lead agency	MDG indicator
Population change	Population growth rate	Yes	UNPD	
_	Total fertility rate		UNPD	
	Dependency ratio	Yes	UNPD	
Tourism	Ratio of local residents to tourists in major tourist regions and destinations		UNWTO	

## Natural hazards

Sub-theme	Indicator	Core indicator	Lead	MDG
			agency	indicator
Vulnerability to	Percentage of population	Yes	UNISDR	
Natural Hazards	living in hazard prone			
	areas, by type of natural			
	hazard			
Disaster	Economic and Human		UNISDR	
Preparedness and	Loss Due to Natural			
Response	Disasters, as percentage of			
	population and of GDP			

## Atmosphere

Sub-theme	Indicator	Core	Lead agency	MDG
		indicator		indicator
Climate Change	Emissions of greenhouse		UNFCCC	
	gases			
	CO2 emissions, total and by	Yes	UNFCCC	Subset
	sector			
Ozone Layer	Consumption of ozone	Yes	UNEP-	Main
Depletion	depleting substances		Ozone	
Air Quality	Ambient concentration of	Yes	WHO	
	air pollutants in urban			
	areas			

### Land

Sub-theme	Indicator	Core indicator	Lead agency	MDG indicator
Land use and status	Land use change		FAO	
	Land degradation		FAO	
Desertification	Land affected by desertification		FAO	
Agriculture	Arable and permanent cropland	Yes	FAO	
	Efficiency of Fertilizer Use		FAO	
	Use of Agricultural Pesticides		FAO	
	Organic farming as percentage of total farming		Eurostat	
	Forest Area as a Percent of Land Area,	Yes	FAO	Subset
Forests	Percent of forests damaged by defoliation		Eurostat	
	Area under sustainable forest management		FAO	

## Oceans, seas and coasts

Sub-theme	Indicator	Core indicator	Lead agency	MDG indicator
	Algae Concentration in Coastal Waters		UNEP	
Coastal Zone	Percentage of total population living in coastal areas	Yes	CIESIN	
	Coastal pollution		UNEP	
Fisheries	Proportion of fish stocks within safe biological limits	Yes	FAO	
Marine environment	Coral reefs		UNEP- WCMC	
	Marine trophic index		FAO	
	Coverage of protected areas as percentage of marine area, total and by ecological region	Yes	UNEP- WCMC	Superset

## Freshwater

Sub-theme	Indicator	Core	Lead	MDG
		indicator	agency	indicator
Water Quantity	Water use as a percentage of renewable water resources	Yes	FAO	
	Water use intensity by industry	Yes	UNSD	
Water Quality	BOD in Water Bodies		UNEP	
	Concentration of faecal Coliform in Freshwater	Yes	WHO	
	Wastewater treatment		UNSD	

## Biodiversity

Sub-theme	Indicator	Core	Lead	MDG
		indicator	agency	indicator
Ecosystem	Coverage of protected areas as	Yes	UNEP-	Superset
	percentage of terrestrial area,		WCMC	
	total and by ecological region			
	Management effectiveness		IUCN,	
	of protected areas		UNEP-	
			WCMC	
	Area of Selected Key		UNEP-	
	Ecosystems		WCMC	
	Fragmentation of habitat		UNEP-	
			WCMC	
Species	Abundance of Selected Key		UNEP-	
	Species		WCMC	
	Assessment of threatened	Yes	IUCN	
	species			
	Invasive species		UNEP-	
	_		WCMC	

## **Economic development**

Sub-theme	Indicator	Core indicator	Lead agency	MDG indicator
	GDP per Capita	Yes	UNSD	
Macroeconomic Performance	Investment Share in GDP	Yes	UNSD	
	Savings Rate		UNSD	
	Adjusted net savings rate		World Bank	
	Inflation		tbd	
Sustainable	Debt to GNI ratio	Yes	World Bank	
Public Finance				
	Labor productivity and unit labor costs	Yes	ILO	
	Employment-population ratio, by sex	Yes	ILO	
Employment	Employment Status, by sex		ILO	
	Share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector	Yes	ILO	Main
	Internet users per 100 population	Yes	ITU	Main
Information and Communication Technologies	Fixed Telephone lines per 100 population		ITU	Main
	Cellular subscribers per 100 population		ITU	Main
Research and Development	R&D Expenditure as percentage of GDP		UNESCO	
Tourism	Tourism contribution to GDP	Yes	UNWTO	

## Global economic partnership

Sub-theme	Indicator	Core	Lead agency	MDG
		indicator		indicator
	Current account deficit as	Yes	tbd	
	percentage of GDP			
Trade	Share of imports from		UNSD	
	developing countries and			
	from LDCs			
	Average tariff barriers		World Bank	Superset/
	against imports from			Subset
	developing countries and			
	LDCs			
External	Net Official	Yes	OECD	Main
financing	Development Assistance			
	(ODA) given or received			
	as a percentage of GNI			
	FDI inflows and outflows		tbd	
	as percentage of GNI			
	Remittances as		tbd	
	percentage of GNI			

## Consumption and production patterns

Sub-theme	Indicator	Core indicator	Lead agency	MDG indicators
Material	Material intensity of the	Yes	Eurostat	
Consumption	economy			
	Domestic material		Eurostat	
	consumption			
Energy Use	Annual Energy	Yes	UNSD	
	Consumption			
	Share of renewable and		UNSD	
	non-renewable sources in			
	total energy supply			
	Intensity of Energy Use,	Yes	UNSD	Main
	total and by sector			
	Generation of Waste		UNSD	
Waste	Generation of Hazardous	Yes	UNEP-SBC	
Generation and	Waste			
Management				
	Management of		IAEA	
	Radioactive Waste			
	Waste Treatment and	Yes	UNSD	
	Disposal			
	Car share of inland	Yes	Eurostat	
	passenger transportation			
Transportation	Road share of inland freight		Eurostat	
	transport			
	Fuel use by distance of		IEA (tbc),	
	passenger transportation		IAEA	
	(Energy intensity of			
	transport)			

#### B. Conclusions and next steps

- 14. The meeting agreed that lead agencies will submit outstanding methodologies sheets by 6 November 2006 to DSD. DSD will circulate the methodology sheets to EGM participants for review and comments
- 15. DSD will also circulate a draft of the publication containing the CSD-ISD, which will include guidance on applying and adapting the CSD-ISD for the development of national indicator sets as well as short descriptions of each indicator and further background material. The complete methodology sheets may be published in electronic format only, thereby easing the incorporation of methodological updates and drastically reducing the number of pages of the publication.
- 16. The guidance material will emphasize that the CSD-ISD is a flexible indicator set that countries are invited to adapt and modify to suit their needs and priorities with regard to sustainable development. The linkages between indicators of sustainable development and national sustainable development strategies will be explicitly discussed. This discussion will include, among others, the role of national targets for sustainable development.
- 17. The publication will include information on the relationship of the CSD-ISD to Agenda 21, the Johannesburg Plan of Implementation and the MDG indicators.
- 18. Concerted efforts by all actors will increase efforts to leverage the CSD-ISD at the national level with other, possibly on-going activities. These efforts could include capacity-building activities specifically on indicators of sustainable development and the incorporation of the CSD-ISD into capacity-building activities in related areas, such as statistical capacities, sector-specific indicators and information management systems, comprehensive development strategies (NSDS, MDG-based strategies, poverty reduction strategies, national developments plans) and reporting obligations of multilateral environmental agreements.
- 19. Continuing inter-agency cooperation will ensure the coherence of CSD-ISD with other indicator processes such as the MDG indicators, the 2010 Biodiversity Indicators Partnership, the Hyogo Framework for Action on disaster reduction and others.
- 20. Technical work, including through expert groups, would further the methodological status and technical depth of a number of CSD-ISD.
- 21. Country experiences in applying and adapting the CSD-ISD will provide important information for further work on indicators of sustainable development. The expert group agreed to examine ways to highlight these experiences, including voluntary reporting to the CSD.

### **Annex: List of Participants**

#### **COUNTRY PARTICIPANTS**

#### **ARGENTINA**

Ms. Patricia Maccagno Agronomical Engineer MSC Secretaria de Ambiente Y Desarrollo Sustentable San Martin 4S1 1st Fl Office 130 Buenos Aires, Argentina C1004AA1

Tel: 54-11 4348 8525 Fax: 54-11 4348 8355

#### **BARBADOS**

Ms. Amrikha Singh **Environmental Officer** Sustainable Development Ministry of Energy and the Environment Barbados Tel: 246-467-5704

Fax: 246-437-8859

#### **EGYPT**

Mr. Moussa Ibrahim Moussa Moustafa Manager of Information System Department Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency 30 Misr-Helwan Agricultural Road, MAADI Cairo, Egypt Tel: 202 525 6465 / +201 221 98313

Fax: +202 525 6479

#### **INDONESIA**

Dr. Indra Darmawan, Head of Subdirectorate for Biodiversity Directorate for Environmental Affairs Ministry of National Development Planning (BAPPENAS) Jln. Taman Suropati No.2 - Jakarta 10310 **INDONESIA** Tel/Fax +62-21-3900412 Mobile +62-818919885

#### **UNITED KINGDOM**

Mr. Stephen Hall Statistician **Environment Protection Statistics and Information Management** Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs 5/F15 Ashdown House 123 Victoria Street London, SW1E 6DE, UK

Tel: 44 20 70 82 86 19 Fax: 44 20 70 82 86 18

#### **UNITED NATIONS**

#### United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs Division for Sustainable Development (DESA/DSD)

Ms. Kathleen Abdalla Chief, National Information, Monitoring and Outreach Branch Two UN Plaza, DC2-2270 New York, N.Y. 10017, USA Tel: 963-8416

Fax: 212-963-1267

Ms. Birgitte Alvarez-Rivero Sustainable Development Officer National Information, Monitoring and Outreach Branch Two UN Plaza, DC2-2262 New York, N.Y. 10017, USA

Tel: 212-963-8400 Fax: 212-963-1267

Mr. Matthias Bruckner Associate Sustainable Development Officer National Information, Monitoring and Outreach Branch Two UN Plaza, DC2-2256 New York, N.Y. 10017, USA Tel: 212-963-2137

Fax: 212-963-2137

#### Forum on Forest Secretariat

Ms. Ghazal Badiozamani Program Officer One UN Plaza, DC1-1240 New York, N.Y.11217, USA

Tel: 1-212-963-4661 Fax: 1-212-917-367-3186

#### **Population Division**

Mr. Paulo M. Saad Population Affairs Officer Two UN Plaza, DC2-1926 New York, N.Y. 10017 Tel: 1-212- 963 3188

#### **Statistical Division**

Ms. Eszter Horvath Chief, Environment and Energy Statistics Branch Two UN Plaza, DC2-1418 New York, N.Y. 10017

Tel: 1-212-963-4581 Fax: 1-212-963-0623

Ms. Alessandra Alfieri Head, Environmental Accounting Unit Economic Statistics Branch Two UN Plaza, DC2-1518 New York, NY 10017

Tel: 1-212-963-4590 Fax: 1-212-963-1374

Ms. Reena Shah Statistician Environment and Energy Statistics Branch Two UN Plaza, DC2-1412 New York, NY 10017 Tel: (212)963-4586 Fax: (212)963-0623

Mr. Bram Edens Associate Statistician Economic Statistics Branch Two UN Plaza, DC2-1532 New York, NY 10017

Tel: +1 917 367 5499 Fax: +1 212 963 1374

#### United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)

Ms. Linda Ghanime Environmental Operations and Policy Adviser Bureau for Development Policy United Nations Development Programme 304 E. 45<sup>th</sup> St. - FF-990 New York, N.Y. 10017

Tel: 212 906 6480 Fax: 212 906 6973

#### **United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP)** UNEP/DEWA - Division of Early Warning and Assessment

Mr. Ashbindu Singh Regional Coordinator, UNEP/DEWA-North America 1707 H Street NW, Suite 300 Washington, DC 2006

Tel: 202 974-1305/202-785-0465

Fax: 202-785-2096

#### **UNEP/WCMC-World Conservation Monitoring Centre**

Mr. Charles Besancon Head of Protected Areas **UNEP World Conservation Monitoring Centre** 219 Huntingdon Road Cambridge, CB3 0DL, United Kingdom

Tel: +44 1223 277314 Ext. 232

Fax: +44 1223 277136

### United Nations International Strategy for Disaster Reduction (UNISDR)

Ms. Helena Molin Valdes Deputy Director of the International Strategy for Disaster Reduction of the United Nations (UN/ISDR) Palais des Nations CH 1211 Geneva 10, Switzerland

Fax: 41 22 9170563

Ms. Elina Palma ISDR Liaison Officer Two United Nations Plaza, DC2-2550 New York, N.Y. 10017, USA Tel (212) 906-6988 Fax: (212) 906-6910

#### United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC)

Mr. Javier Teran Castro Statistician Wagramer Strasse 5 Room E-1539 1400 Vienna, Austria Tel: 43-1-26060 4419

Fax: 43-1-26060 5866

#### SPECIALIZED AGENCIES

#### United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)

Ms. Diana Maria Stukel Head of Section, Methodology UNESCO Institute for Statistics CP 6128, Succursale Centre Ville Montreal, ZC, Canada, H3C 3J7

Tel: +1-514-343-7753 Fax: +1-514-343-6872

#### Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO)

Mr. Jeff Tschirley Chief, Environment & Natural Resources Service Sustainable Development Department Viale delle Terme di Caracalla Rome 00100, Italy Tel: + 39-06-5705-3450

#### **International Labour Organization (ILO)**

Mr. Lawrence J. Johnson Senior Labour Market Economist 4, route des Morillons CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland

Tel: 41 22 799 7012 Fax: 41 22 799 6386

#### The World Bank

Mr. Giovanni Ruta Environment Department - The World Bank 1818, H Street, NW - Mail Stop MC5-511 Washington, DC 20433, USA Tel: 202 473-9388

Fax: 202 522-1735

#### **United Nations World Tourism Organization**

Gabor Vereczi Programme Officer World Tourism Organization Calle Capitan Haya 42 Madrid /Spain/28020 Phone: ++34 915678216

Fax: ++34 915713733

#### INTER-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS

### **European Commission, EUROSTAT**

Mr. Graham Lock Commission of the European Communities Batiment Jean Monnet Rue Alcide de Gasperi Luxembourg L-2920 Tel: 352-4301-33406

Fax: 352-4301-33406

#### **Economic Cooperation Organization (ECO)**

Mr. Fazli Sak
Programme Officer
ECO Secretariat
No. 1, Golbou Alley, Wouth Kamranieh
P.O. Box 14155-6176
Tehran/Islamic Republic of Iran

Tel: (98-21) 22 83 17 33-4 ext. 269

Fax: (98-21) 22 83 17 32

#### NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS

#### Scientific Committee on Problems of the Environment (SCOPE)

Prof. Tomas Hak

Professor, Charles University Environment Center

U Krize 8, Prague 5, 158 00 Czech Republic

Tel: 420-251-080-344 Fax: 420-251-620-441

# Center for International Earth Science Information Network (CIESIN)/Columbia University CIESIN/COLUMBIA

Mr. Mark Levy Associate Director CIESIN, Earth Institute, Columbia University 61 Route 9W, Palisades, NY 10964 USA Tel: 845 365 8964

Fax: 845 365 8964

Mr. Alex de Sherbinin Senior Staff Associate for Research 61 Route 9W, Palisades, NY 10964 USA

Tel: 845 365 8936 Fax: 845 365 8922